

CY 2012 ODA Portfolio Review
Lessons Learned from Impact Evaluations and Other Evaluation Studies Conducted

Project Title	Lessons Learned
Impact Evaluations	
WB	
1. Philippines Conditional Cash Transfer Program 2012	<p>The program impacts observed include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In education, the program is helping to keep younger children in school. • In health, the program is meeting its objective of helping to keep children healthy. • The program is also achieving its objectives by allowing households to invest more in meeting the health and education needs of their children. • The program has improved the effectiveness of other government programs for the poor, as evidenced by the increased reported coverage of Phil Health. • However, the study was unable to identify a program impact on aggregate consumption/expenditures, even though expenditures on education and health increased and results from some areas suggest an increase in savings. <p>The challenges include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To improve educational outcomes for older children, additional measures such as expanding the age of coverage of <i>PantawidPamilya</i>, increasing the period of coverage per family from the current five years, increasing the grant amount for older children, and parallel supply-side interventions in the education sector should be explored. • Linkages and coordination with health service providers need to be strengthened to ensure that beneficiary mothers and children receive the services they require and to ensure a continuum of care. • It is important to consider ways in which other social programs that may have a long-term impact on the welfare of the poor could take advantage of <i>Pantawid Pamilya</i>'s strong and effective social mobilization structure. • Further effort is needed to ensure that beneficiaries receive the full grant amounts to which they are entitled. • The reasons for heterogeneity of program impacts across geographical areas must be better identified and understood to ensure more efficient program implementation.
2. The KALAHI-CIDSS Impact Evaluation: A Synthesis Report	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The project team should explore ways to (a) support local communities' access to alternative and additional sources of funding, and (b) differentiate barangay grants by poverty levels. • Results from the evaluation also suggest that maintenance arrangements for water projects might be inadequate. • The project team should carry out a thorough maintenance

	<p>review of various project types.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The study should also propose ways to improve maintenance arrangements in the future. • The project team should compile and facilitate access to data on the efficiency and effectiveness of different types of sectoral investments. • The project team should carefully review the questionnaires used in the evaluation to better capture relevant data on outcomes and impacts. • If one wants to build an empirical basis to inform policy and operational decisions, systems need to be put in place to (a) allow DSWD to identify areas where more research is needed; (b) carry out the studies in close collaboration between the project team and researchers; and, most importantly, (c) act upon research findings
--	---

Other Evaluations

ADB	
3. Power Sector Development Program	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • While the design of a cluster program provides the benefit of flexibility (i.e., deferring subprograms wherein the program design cannot be fully defined at appraisal), care must be taken to maximize the achievement of critical objectives even if ongoing subprograms are canceled.
4. Development of Poor Urban Communities Sector Project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • LGU-driven projects are important and strategic for targeting the urban poor. LGUs could have played a crucial role in provision of land, particularly land that the President Philippines has proclaimed for social housing purposes. HDMF lending needed to open up to LGU-initiated socialized housing projects, even if they were for non-HDMF members. To serve the urban poor, LGUs needed to innovate and provide guarantee funds (guaranteed by the IRA) or other forms of collateral) for HDMF lending operations to the urban poor. In addition, implementation of socialized housing projects needed to make use of MFI collection practices. • Private developers needed to be given incentives to allocate part of their housing projects to the urban poor. The private sector modality could have worked out if established in tandem with a take-out mechanism from HDMF.
5. Pasig River Environmental Management and Rehabilitation Sector Development Program	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The difficulties and problems encountered in implementation could have been reduced if a thorough risk assessment and mitigation plan were done during program formulation. • The responsibility of implementing the program was given to the PRRC, a newly established agency with insufficient management capacity and without established political influence. The program could have been improved if responsibility for implementation was delegated to concerned agencies with expertise and proven track record.
6. Agrarian Reform	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The use of a clear and sound DMF to direct project implementation and coordination;

Communities Project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Promoting stakeholder participation and ownership in the project for greater probability of success; Flexibility in specific investments to achieve intended outputs; Importance of detailed feasibility studies of enterprises and agribusinesses to assure viability; Use of external sources of LGUs other than their regular allocations for equity on the subprojects; Unsuitability of ARC cooperatives in target areas for LBP lending due to pre-existing past due accounts or inability to meet LBP's cooperative accreditation criteria.
7. Metro Manila Air Quality Improvement Sector Development Program	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A complex and overambitious program should not have been designed. A simpler program designed in phases or steps might have been more realistic and would have stood a greater chance of achieving better results. There was a mismatch between the program's expectations from those of the executing agency and the implementing agencies, and their capacity to deliver such expectations
AusAid	
8. Provincial Road Management Facility (PRMF)/DILG/AusAID	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The project has been effective in introducing administrative reforms into the partner provinces and that the reforms has improved the management of provincial roads, all the said project gains in administrative reforms were only at the technical and administrative level.
JICA	
9. Pampanga Delta Development Project, Flood Control Component	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Had adequate preparation been made for land acquisition and the process properly coordinated, project progress could have been expedited and local opposition transformed into approval. More specifically, had the budget secured for the resettlement program at an earlier stage and preparations of the resettlement site been timed to coincide with eviction orders, these measures might have helped to build consensus among affected residents and have facilitated the eviction process. The lessons learned from this project have been incorporated into the executing agency's guidelines on land acquisition and involuntary resettlement (2003 edition).
10. Boracay Environmental Infrastructure Project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> To avoid planning based on undervalued demand forecast, it is necessary to frequently review until the decisions are made for the planned values and specifications for construction work, especially for infrastructure development projects in which it is difficult to determine the potential demand, such as the tourism development In assistance for regional development projects in recipient countries where the transition to decentralization is occurring, it is advisable to ensure sufficient participation from local governments and raising a sense of ownership from the project planning stage so that it will improve collaboration among agencies and business entities during and after the project and utilization of facilities.
11. Forestry Sector Project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Based on the results of the beneficiary survey, the success of income enhancement programs improved beneficiaries'

	<p>incomes and strengthened organizing capacities of POs. This in turn led to a trend towards proper forest operation and maintenance activities. It is hoped that income enhancement components will be introduced into reforestation projects. In order to implement a good income enhancement project, it would be effective to use NGOs that possess business expertise and have contacts with private companies, and employ experts to support making a plan and to assess it.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There were cases that products were fairly distributed and money for work were properly compensated because a prior agreement for distribution of products was not prepared and people's organization was not organized after the implementation of agroforestry. It is hoped to prepare a code of people's organization with residents before project implantation. • At the time of the appraisal, it was agreed with the implementation system and implementation and operational procedure for the project. At the stage of the project implementation, more detailed guideline became necessary. The DENR, based on the results of the JBIC Interim Monitoring Survey, established SUSIMO to support POs, and in so doing the project was able to make progress. It is hoped a system and procedures will be developed for implementing projects in the form of guidelines or manuals at the planning stage of reforestation project. • In the project, the cases were observed that it was led to delay in schedule and increase in the project due to poor performance of some NGOs which were entrusted SMP and CO. On the other hand, some NGOs have contacts with the private sector, possess business expertise, and have experience of implementing income improvement programs. It is hoped their strengths will be made sure of when working with NGOs. Their role would include collaboration with customers, negotiations on sales prices, and quality control of products, for instance.
<p>12. Rehabilitation and Maintenance of Bridges along Arterial Road (I)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In Phase I of the project, the project cost was increased due to considerable changes in design. It is advisable to consider the ODA loan scheme for the project like this not to specify the project targets so as to enable to adapt flexibly for changes without specifying the targets in the project implementation stage. • Moreover, contractors and consultants should combine their efforts in confirming the appropriateness of construction timing, taking wet and dry seasons into consideration in order to keep damage from natural disasters to a minimum. As was the case in Phase II, such effort can shorten the work period and keep the effects from natural disasters on project implementation to a minimum. • Moreover, in this evaluation the EIRR was calculated following the computation methods for project benefits

	<p>employed by the JICA feasibility study to keep consistency with the time of appraisal. The sunk costs due to time passage were not taken into consideration in the assumptions used for calculating the EIRR in this evaluation. Due to this and other factors, some bridges had excessively high figures.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In particular, for the computation of cost and benefits used as assumptions for further calculations, it is necessary to perform a second validation of the Feasibility Study at the time of appraisal.
<p>13. Nationwide Air Navigation Facilities Modernization Project – Phase III</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • After the detailed design was completed procurement and commencement of construction work were planned. However, progress was delayed from the preparatory stage of construction work, as well as during the construction itself. This fact resulted in a significant extension of the project period. • At the same time, technology is advancing at a remarkable pace in the field of the communication equipment and facilities provided in the project. Consequently, delays in construction lead to delays in the rollout of technology of the equipment and facilities provided in the project. Such delays have a direct impact on the effectiveness of the project. To minimize this problem, it is necessary to include an actual procurement plan in the detailed project design.
<p>14. Maritime Safety Improvement Project</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Shortages in the supply of electricity by the distribution company, failures or defects of the diesel power generator, a rise in operation and maintenance costs and human error had been the problems in ensuring a stable power source for the lighthouses and proper operation of the marine navigational aids. This project was effective in solving these problems in that it helped introduce photovoltaic power generation as the power source for lighthouses and lighted buoys.
<p>15. Philippine-Japan Friendship Highway Rehabilitation Project (I) (II)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Some important long-standing baseline information which may be sourced from feasibility studies and the implementation plan prepared by the DPWH are not preserved, making it difficult to compare various aspects of the planned and projected data like the budget, economic indicators, and traffic volume. Although DPWH addresses the issue of information management, such as archiving past data, it requires further improvement. • Moreover, the Project Management Office (PMO) is examining changing the project scope with a regional office that is in charge of each road. PMO should also thoroughly discuss with the regional office the financial ramifications that may be caused by the change.
<p>16. Special Economic Zones Environment Management Project</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are issues concerning data in the FS which are different from that of the appraisal report, therefore it is impossible to verify the base data and target index at the planning stage. It is desired that modified information as a result of the review during appraisal be recorded in the appraisal documents.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • For agencies that are unfamiliar with ODA loans, the lending agency should assist the borrower on the procedures including procurement to avoid project delays. • As the timing of implementation for project components which are necessary for the project effect has a big impact on effectiveness, the executing agencies should always formulate a realistic plan. (One of reasons for the limited project benefits which affected effectiveness was that the construction of the sewage pipeline network was not included in the project scope.) In addition, JICA should also scrutinize the schedule and project scope.
<p>17. Industrial and Support Services Expansion Program (Phase II) (ISSEP II)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Despite the fact that the sub-loan interest rate was revised several times because market interest rates declined significantly during the project period, the situation occurred in which the sub-loan interest rate was near or at the same level as the market interest rate. For this reason, at times the interest rate was lower on loans at market interest rates than on loans using this project's funds once the PFI's spread was added on. At such times, there was stagnation of project loans extended through PFIs. DBP lowered the wholesale interest rate as much as possible in order to continue loaning using the wholesale method while preserving DBP's own profit, but it was difficult for DBP to cope with the large decline in market interest rates. Consequently, it should be recognized that there is an inherent structural risk that loans using the wholesale method will stagnate in cases when the market interest rates decline greatly.
<p>18. Metro Manila Interchange Construction Project (IV)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More detailed engineering investigation and designs should be undertaken in order to avoid any variations/change orders and supplemental agreements during the implementation, which quite often result in a delay of implementation and cost overruns. • In order to minimize the delay of project implementation due to land acquisition and resettlement, the executing agency should organize a project coordination committee, which may consist of DPWH, local government units, and other stakeholders (private 17 and public) and establish a coordination body to enhance dialogue and contact with the neighbouring residents. • According to the implementation schedule shown in the appraisal document, the period from the loan signing date to the completion date of the three interchanges is planned for two years and four months, and the construction period is estimated at one year and four months. The planned schedule seems to be underestimated. In planning the implementation schedule, pragmatic scheduling, taking into consideration the time needed for land acquisition, tendering process, and more realistic construction period should be made. The JBIC appraisal team should engage in thorough discussions with the borrower at the appraisal stage so that more realistic and pragmatic scheduling can

	<p>be achieved.</p>
<p>19. Fisheries Resource Management Project</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In the LGUs which participated in this project, the coastal resource management program has been integrated into the development plan of each LGUs and project objectives were somehow achieved. However, the readiness to continue the program (sustainability of the project) differs from LGU to LGU. From this experience, since continued BFAR's technical assistance (promotion, training and monitoring) and administrative guidance is needed even after the project completion, it is most important to select a LGU who indicates "ownership of the project and willingness to continue the project even after the project completion" during a project preparation/processing stage. • Due to lengthy procurement process for equipment/materials and consulting services, a few subcomponents were not implemented. It is essential at the project preparation stage: i) to provide training to staff of relevant executing agencies on domestic/JICA's procurement process and procedures; and ii) to prepare a detailed procurement implementation plan and share this information with all the relevant project executing agencies. • Since the selection of equipment (such as patrol boats) was made without detailed consultation on operation manners with the end-users at the operation stage, it was difficult to properly maintain and operate some equipment. Later, specifications for some equipment were downgraded to fit into local conditions. At the appraisal stage, it is essential to select the efficient model taking into consideration the operation manner (usage) and sustainability of the equipment in the local conditions.
<p>20. Metro Manila Strategic Mass Rail Transit Development (I), (II), (III)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The project for construction of a urban mass transit system generally requires a huge initial capital investment. Since the project could not be viable depending on only fare revenue, it is considered that provision of capital investment and subsidies from the 14 government is inevitable. At the preparation and appraisal stages, detailed financial analysis and financial planning (dissolution of an excess of debt, planning of debt returning, strengthening of management fundamentals) should be made and an Action Plan for the government assistance should be developed. During the project implementation, the action plan needs to be strictly monitored so that the proposed actions are implemented as planned. • Due to difficulties of obtaining spare parts, four trains are not currently operational. At the project preparation stage, the following should be investigated: availability of spare parts locally; and how to obtain spare parts if locally unavailable. When the equipment is purchased, spare parts needs to be purchased at the same time and the required number and items of spare parts should be included in the contract for the purchase of equipment. • There are few riders in Betty Go and J.Ruiz stations. These

	<p>stations entail costs during construction and additional O&M costs. These could have been avoided if a more in-depth travel demand analysis was conducted during the FS preparation.</p>
<p>21. Third Elementary Education Project (TEEP)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The project supported all concerned parties, such as the central government (DepED staff), local governments (division offices), school sites (principals and teachers) and even communities (Barangai/PTCA), and made efforts to improve the capacity of central and local organizations (as well as individuals) at the school sites. Furthermore, such support at various levels led to the enhancement of each individual knowledge and capacity, and fostered their own responsibilities and initiative to implement related activities. In addition to support for school buildings and related facilities, it is believed that soft support that included training for teachers and staff has also led to high achievements. As mentioned above, a holistic approach for support implementation to multi-level targets with a good balance between hard and soft components has brought substantial results.
<p>22. Domestic Shipping Modernization Program II</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Although the qualitative effects of the areas and sub-projects that were covered by the two-step loan were set at the time of the appraisal, some of the developmental projects, and the operation and effect indicators for sub-projects were not set in advance. This was because at that time, the use of operation and effect indicators was still not institutionalized. • In the future, efforts to identify and set operation and effect indicators in advance of sub-projects will be very important in order for the loans to end-users to achieve their objectives. The difficulty to set these indicators beforehand for two-step loans became clear in this Program, especially because sub-projects were identified only after the loan had started. However, from the point of view of project evaluation, setting indicators and their targets at the time of the appraisal is very important.
<p>23. Provincial Cities Water Supply Project (Phases III, IV, V)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There were periodical meetings attended by JICA (formerly JBIC) and LWUA before and during implementation of the Project to discuss countermeasures to cope with the causes of delays in the Project implementation. However, in spite of these discussions, all three phases of the Project were significantly delayed, because the long decision making process in LWUA contributed to a disruption in the execution of the countermeasures. In addition, another possible cause of delay during the planning stage of the Project was that sufficient examination was not made of implementation issues such as delayed acquisition of rights of way or the ability of the Executing Agency to manage these issues. Therefore, in implementation of future projects, it is recommended that, in order to prepare much more workable project plans, the organizational capacity of the Executing Agency as well as the specific conditions

	<p>surrounding the implementation of the project are thoroughly examined.</p>
<p>24. Tiwi and Makban Geothermal Power Plant Complex Rehabilitation Project</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In relation to sustainability of geothermal energy, the volume of steam decreases if recovery of hot underground water does not catch up with the extraction of hydrothermal from geothermal reservoir. Tiwi Geothermal Power Plant already had difficulty in operating 6 units at rated output when the project was planned. On top of unfavorable geographical condition of being close to seashore and prone to be affected by seawater, the plant used to operate at rated output of 55MW×6 units, that caused to decrease steam volume year after year. Currently, 2 units are completely closed. The steam volume is hardly sufficient to operate 4 rehabilitated units at rated output. It is important to be mindful about not losing the balance of geothermal reservoir when planning the development or rehabilitation project of geothermal power plant like this. • A big factor that caused the long delay in the project implementation is confusion persisted in the wake of steam supply contract (25 years) expiration in 1996. For planning an energy development project like this, it is important to fully analyze risks and consider measures to control the risks associated with stable supply of fuel source, indispensable for smooth operation after completion of a project. • Deterioration of the existing facilities continued while the project implementation was suspended, leading to increase repair cost per unit and delayed effects from being produced. Mixed with the reform of power sector, introduction of privatization policy and other complex political factors, the project implementation required considerable time for review. However, the government of a borrowing country should have committed more strongly to expedite the project and achieve the target of “stable power supply”. To avoid substantial delay in implementation of project like this, strong commitment of a borrowing country and effective measures of the government of a lending country and JICA are desired if any change to external conditions possibly seriously affecting the project is confirmed in times of progress status monitoring.
<p>25. Northern Negros Geothermal Project</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In the Philippines, where geothermal resources abundantly exist, geothermal power is a promising renewable energy source. In addition, geothermal power is more desirable than other power sources in terms of CO2 emission. The effectiveness of the project was low. However, this result needs to be reviewed with the recovery of steam amount in future and does not mean that the relevancy of geothermal power generation in the Philippines is undermined. The development risk, as a unique risk of geothermal power generation, severely affects project effectiveness. This risk became an issue for this project also.

	<p>For this Project, the executing agency conducted a feasibility study. The development risk was tried to be reduced by conducting the Special Assistance for Project Formation study but it could not be completely avoided. The tightness in the electricity demand and supply and additional cost needs to be taken into consideration. Nevertheless, it is desirable that measures to reduce development risk are examined at appraisal.</p>
<p>26. Rural Road Network Development Project (II)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One of the reasons why the construction period was extended is the frequent changes of scope due to various finding at the time of Detailed Design (D/D). With regard to this issue, it is not appropriate to stick to the original scope and proceed in order to avoid a prolonged construction period. However, when a long time has elapsed after conducting the F/S, geological conditions may change significantly owing to typhoons, for example. Accordingly, substantial modifications in terms of repair methods, construction period and cost may become inevitable. Such a situation may affect the project in the form of extended project period and fund shortages and also project evaluation. • Therefore, it is worth considering a review of F/S before D/D and making the necessary amendment to the basic elements of the project plan, when considerable time has elapsed after F/S and the geological condition has changed significantly.
<p>27. Arterial Road Links Development Project (Phase IV)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In this project lengthening of the land acquisition was a major cause of construction delay. This means that not only the following project phase of construction was delayed but also construction process itself was affected by the simultaneously undertaken land acquisition. In this case it was time consuming because the population density was high at the project site. From now on they should allow enough time for the land acquisition in such a highly populated area and should complete land acquisition before the beginning of construction.
<p>28. Lower Agusan Development Project</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The O&M responsibilities of the flood control facilities remained unclear despite the agreement between the DPWH and Butuan City, which resulted in inappropriate budget allocations and insufficient O&M. When the facilities and O&M responsibilities are to be transferred to local government after the completion of projects, JICA should include in its project design a system where the transfer processes of documents, ownership, the necessary O&M equipment and know-how will be completed during the project period or monitor the processes as a follow-up measure. More binding instruments or documents to ensure continuous commitment by the local governments will also be required. • The effect and impact of the irrigation component was significantly reduced due to the conversion of the FUSA to other purposes. For irrigation projects in urban areas or areas

	<p>where further development is anticipated, and when there is a long lag time between FS preparation and commencement of implementation, the target area should be critically reviewed and determined with the participation of the recipient local governments, referring to their land use development plan and policies. In the project plan, it was assumed that 100% of the FUSA would be irrigated and planted in three years after completion, but this was unrealistic. Risks and other factors leading to the inability to actually irrigate 100% of the FUSA, such as conversion of the FUSA to other purposes and the existence of absentee landowners as experienced in this project, should be considered and practical plan and targets should be set and appraised.</p>
<p>29. Pinatubo Hazard Urgent Mitigation Project - Phase II</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It turned out that the operation/maintenance budget for the facilities of the project was not secured constantly. One of the reasons why operation/maintenance budget is properly secured at this moment is that plans for budget amount and shares to be paid by relevant authorities were not specified and formulated beforehand. When JICA extend cooperation concerning infrastructure facility development like this project in the future, it is desirable to do the following; first, to formulate a cost plan for an operation/maintenance and its sharing scheme for about 5 to 10 years after completion at the time of appraisal; second, to review budget forecasts in accordance to the changes at detailed designing and implementation phases; and third, to make sure that JICA and the implementation agency reconfirm the plans for maintenance and operation together with specific budget measures and shares of responsibilities at the time of the project completion.
<p>30. Philippine-Japan Friendship Highway (Mindanao Section) Rehabilitation Project, Phase I and II</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In this project, several problems could have been avoided if DEOs of the DPWH and LGUs were more actively involved from the design stage. Therefore, in similar projects, full consultation with DPWH DEOs and LGUs from the planning to implementation stages is recommended. Such consultation will enable a project to obtain detailed information on the roads and the environment in the regions and reflect it in the project design. Further, additional requirements on the project scope from LGUs and the resulting cost increase and schedule extension could be reduced. DPWH DEOs may also be able to assist in project monitoring during project implementation to complement the PMO and the consultants. Any future project should also include the necessary costs to cover reproduction expenses of design documents, As-Built Plans and other turn-over documents for distribution to DEOs. • The project was delayed significantly from the original plan. The most significant cause of the delay was the poor capacity of the contractors that led to the suspension of civil works. A strict Pre-Qualification (PQ) process is required to appraise the capacity of bidding contractors, in

	particular their financial capacity.
31. Southern Mindanao Integrated Coastal Zone Management Project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The components of forestry, agro-forestry, and LAP were implemented even in the communities in less accessible remote areas, and the STFs were constructed and operated even in the municipalities in the area of unstable security situations, such as Sarangani coast. Nevertheless, these projects have been effectively managed and have contributed to economic and social improvements of the communities. Therefore, it is highly possible and meaningful to consider executing this type of projects even in places like Central and Western Mindanao, where the security situations cannot allow to implement projects easily, with certain level of stability and strong communities' will. • The Scope changes from STP to STFs as well as the delay of the turnover of STF to the municipality of Glan are derived from the local political movement. Therefore, in order to avoid having situations where local politics hinder effective implementation and appropriate management of projects, it is necessary to obtain adequate consensus towards the projects, to carry out suitable stakeholder analysis prior to the implementation, and to perform project planning based on the result of the above analysis.
32. Selected Airports (Trunkline) Development Project (I) & (II)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It was originally planned that CENECO, a private local power supply company, would build a substation for new Bacolod airport, which though was not built during the project construction period. Therefore, the airport has the problem of power voltage instability. It was confirmed at the evaluation survey in September 2010 that CENECO is building the substation near the airport, which should solve the problem of power voltage instability in the near future. The issue of power supply, including contracts with power suppliers, should be well planned at the project planning stage for similar projects in the future, as it is vital for operation of facilities and equipment. • Construction of new Bacolod airport was temporarily suspended as there was an explosion near the power generating facility caused by an anti-government group. Adequate measures should be taken for similar projects in the future in order to prevent trespassers to enter the construction site.
33. Mindanao Container Terminal Project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Outsourcing Operation and Maintenance Work • The Philippine government originally had the policy of outsourcing operation and maintenance on ports to private sectors, which is shown in MTPDP 1999-2004. Based on the policy, PIA, the executing agency, outsourced operation and maintenance work to an outside operator from the beginning since the agency does not have adequate expertise in port operation. However, because the procurement process took a long time, outsourcing was started four years after the completion of the container terminal construction, and the indicators that were established at the planning stage. Therefore the project did

	<p>not achieve its original target of the indicators set at the planning stage, although the marketing abilities and networks of the commissioned company resulted in increasing demand for the terminal. It is also expected that handling of highly-profitable international cargoes will steadily increase. This may lead to the improvement in financial strengths required for the future sustainable development. Therefore, for the relatively-profitable business, outsourcing of particular functions such as operation and maintenance to outside entities and actively utilizing their abilities to support the executing agencies is practical and quite valuable for improving the effects of business.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Importance of Activities to Find Talented outside Operator • Because no qualified contractor participated in the first and second biddings, and bidding had to be conducted three times, the process of selecting resourceful operators for this project took plenty of time. This has resulted in the reduced effects and delay of the project. This is partly due to insufficient ability of the executing agency to set appropriate bidding conditions and actively transmit information to many relevant companies during the course of the bidding process. They did not have enough experiences with international cargo movement (exports/imports) or knowledge about port operation companies that meet world-class standards. Therefore, when outsourcing the operation/maintenance operations in the future for improving effectiveness, an executing agency should conduct study about related industry and companies and set appropriate 74 bidding conditions, well in advance to conducting the bidding session.
<p>34. Cordillera Road Improvement Project</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In the process of interviews conducted in this survey, it was confirmed that budget allocation was conducted uniformly on a nationwide basis in accordance with government rules calling for assignment of personnel at a rate of one worker per a certain length. Since road conditions and terrain vary by locale, it would be desirable to apply a more flexible rule in accordance with local conditions, allowing more staff allocated in the mountainous area or the area with frequent landslide.
<p>35. Agrarian Reform Infrastructure Support Project (Phase 2)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The IA conducted the O&M of the irrigation and drainage facilities developed in the project. Neither DAR nor NIA is monitoring activities of the IAs in the project areas from a technical viewpoint after the project completion. DAR and LGUs, with the technical cooperation of NIA, shall not only provide continuous technical assistance but also monitor the IAs of which organizational maturity is low when similar projects are implemented, since there are some cases where these facilities are not working effectively.
<p>36. Metro Manila Flood Control Project – West of Mangahan Floodway</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Land acquisition and resettlement • When any executing agency of a project requires consensus-building related to land acquisition and

	<p>resettlement, appropriate explanation to concerned community members and organization of public hearings at an early stage of project implementation are relevant. It is important to involve academia/expert such as local university, and is essential to invite a large number of beneficiaries to public hearings for information sharing. In the project, the DPWH requested that the University of the Philippines conduct a study to understand better the needs of the communities in the project area. Because of the study, part of the scope of the civil works was modified. This is a good example of the executing agency giving high importance to social consolidations in the project area.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Establishing an appropriate O&M structure at the time of project completion is very important. It is especially critical to plan and establish a new and sustainable O&M structure by careful analysis of consequences when an executive agency of project goes through organizational reform during project implementation. • Conducting O&M activities of facilities developed under project(s) more effectively, not only the LGU whose technical and financial capacities are not stable, but the central government of the Philippines shall also take part when necessary. • Adequate indicators shall be set when a project in the field of flood control is formulated in the future. Necessary data according to the indicators set shall be monitored and recorded regularly.
<p>37. Upgrading Human Resources Development Project for Air Navigation Systems Specialist and at the Civil Aviation Training Center</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Based on the Plan, the project should have produced around 370 graduates but actual number only reached 345 graduates. These can be attributed the following: • Not enough ANCC personnel to undergo the training due to facility work schedule. • Number of JICA-CATC Counterpart Instructor lessened by two, caused delay in the training program. • Limited number of ILS, Radar Facilities, therefore the only less ANSS will be trained • Problem: Training equipment at CATC is somewhat different from the actual equipment in the facilities. Training equipment should match the one used in trainings. • It is necessary for the training to be continuous, evolving and revisions of ANSS regulation should take place. • Preparation time was not properly utilized in the early part, which led to delay in the implementation of the project.
<p>38. Second Magsaysay Bridge and Butuan City Bypass Road Project</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Delay in construction due to weather conditions, use of imported construction materials which are delivered to the Port of Manila, delayed payment and billings • Contractor had initial difficulty of hiring qualified local staff • Will decongest traffic in Butuan City and drive economic growth in the region. It will also benefit farmers who transfer their farm products.
<p>NZAP</p>	
<p>39. Participatory Review of</p>	<p>Contributing Factors:</p>

<p>the Local Government Unit Management Training Project</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Good leadership of the Project Director; • Active participation of the Project Steering Committee; • Responsive project management policies, systems and delivery protocols, including sound financial management; • Thorough monitoring of project activities and output quality; • Support and commitment of agency heads and local chief executives; • Sustained participation of local service providers and Local Government Unit staff; • High absorptive capacity of Unit staff for project development work; • Strong secretariat support to the Local Service Provider Network; and • Effective risk mitigation and management. <p>Hindering Factors:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Network Development – initial resistance of some institutions to join the network; large network membership prolonging consensus and trust building process; weak capacities of Local Service Provider members, particularly the NGOs; inadequate time and resources devoted to Network organisational activities • Training – too compressed training duration; inappropriate training participants for some Local Government Units; low project/program development and management competence of some assigned coaches; limited data availability; limited access of Local Government Units to information and communication technologies • Project Management – limited availability of the Philippines National Economic and Development Authority – Technical Assistance Team in project activities due to competing office workload; and inadequate project management staff complement leading to an overloaded Project Implementation Unit.
<p>USAID</p>	
<p>40. External Evaluation of Tuberculosis Portfolio (2006-2011)</p> <p>Note: USAID's Tuberculosis Portfolio currently supports the following projects:</p> <p>Linking Initiatives and Networking to Control Tuberculosis (TB LINC)/DOH</p> <p>Strengthening Local Governance for Health (HealthGov)</p> <p>Health Policy Development</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Need to balance public private mix (PPM) initiatives with initiatives that destigmatize public services and increase awareness about the availability of free/ discounted services • Innovative approaches are effective (when properly managed/supervised) in filling human resource gaps • Forward planning is important when introducing new TB services • The need to balance resource-intensive new technologies for TB case detection with low-cost ones • The importance of considering the usability/ value of indicators at the local level when planning monitoring and evaluation (M&E) systems for TB projects • The value lost when projects are implemented independently, rather than as part of the strategic whole • Effective approaches to advocating for sustainable increases in funding for health, including TB, at local levels.

<p>Program (HPDP)/ DOH</p> <p>Health Promotion and Communication (HealthPRO)/ DOH</p> <p>Sustainable Health Improvement through Empowerment and Local Development (SHIELD)/ Helen Keller International, Inc.</p> <p>Strengthening Pharmaceutical Systems (SPS)/ Management Sciences for Health (MSH)</p> <p>United States Pharmacopeia Promoting the Quality of Medicine (USP PQM)/ Food and Drug Administration (FDA) and DOH- National Center for Disease Prevention and Control (NCDPC)</p>	
<p>41. Performance Evaluation of Growth with Equity in Mindanao III (GEM-3) Program</p>	<p>Component 1: Infrastructure Development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Good Practices • Concentration of BIPs over RIPs is a good choice in conflict-affected areas given the greater visibility of BIPs in local areas compared to a few large projects • Bad Practices • Removal of pre-selection of contractors two (2) years ago in its contractor selection and vetting process • Relationship of Scale and Scope of Infrastructure to Program Targets and Objectives • Impact of the following subprojects stand out: (a) RIPs; (b) BIPs with large number of beneficiaries; (c) BIPs focused on post-harvest facilities <p>Component 2: Workforce Preparation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Parent-Teacher Associations (PTA) had low probability of EMPG at different levels of operation • Most schools visited were maladapted to ensuring clean environment and regulated temperatures for the long-term use equipment for IT education • Participants under the JEEP have difficulty raising the required capital outlay and resources to continue JEEP. Private institutions had higher chances of sustainability <p>Component 3: Governance Improvement</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lack of personnel as well as the necessary skills necessary to implement revised tax collection strategies continue to be a hindrance for REAP's sustainability.

	<p>Component 4: Business Growth</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The program was overly broad but capable of acting opportunistically to new business opportunities • The cluster approach (greater focus on clustered activities is an effective way of maximizing resources and fostering unity among those with similar interests. <p>Component 5: Former Combatant Reintegration (FCR)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Beneficiaries have useful suggestions to improve/ adapt assistance such as the following: (a) conduct of a more thorough needs assessments; (b) direct consultation with the targeted community; (c) providing more frequent monitoring and technical follow-up; and (d) the range of support activities be increased and targeted at the communal
<p>42. Performance Evaluation of the Family Planning (FP) and Maternal and Child Health (MCH) Portfolio</p> <p>Note: USAID's FP and MCH portfolio currently supports the following projects:</p> <p>Strengthening Local Governance in Health (HealthGOV)/ Research Triangle Institutes (RTI)</p> <p>Sustainable Health Improvement and Empowerment through Local Development (SHIELD)/ Helen Keller International (HKI)</p> <p>Private Sector Mobilization for Family Health (PRISM2)/ Chemonics International</p> <p>Health Promotion and Communication (HealthPRO)/ University Research Co. (URC)</p> <p>Health Policy Development Project (HPDP)/ UP Econ Foundation</p>	<p>Good Practices</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Enhancing community involvement through formation of Community Health Action Teams (CHATs) which trained volunteers to provide basic FP and MCH information to the communities • Allowing midwives to provide life-saving practices and drugs in the ARMM, e.g., active management of the third stage of labor and oxytocin without a physician's supervision • Introduction of postpartum Intrauterine devices (IUDs) • Accreditation of facilities by PhilHealth and enrollment of PhilHealth beneficiaries in the • public and private sectors. <p>Factors Contributing to the Improvement of FP and MCH Indicators</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Appropriate integration of services, such as FP with maternity care, helps to address a wider range of health needs of the clients and increases efficiency of the programs. • Accreditation of facilities by PhilHealth for the maternity care package (MCP) and enrollment of PhilHealth beneficiaries is a sustainable financing mechanism to improve FP and MCH services, and is supported by national policies • Presence of a local champion and a good manager and leader can motivate other stakeholders, influence the adoption of desirable practices, and facilitate the mobilization of national and local resources. • Political support at the national level ensures that FP and MCH will have a prominent place on the national agenda, and that adequate financial resources are allocated. • A match between supply and demand of services is important.
<p>43. Evaluation of the Economic Impact of</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • FMR type of projects were highly valued by rural residents and thus in great demand. • High benefit-cost ratios generated from road subprojects

Infrastructure Projects	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Building more RIPs makes greater economic sense than building more BIPs. • Building infrastructure in a barangay resulted in reductions in violence in that barangay. • Building infrastructure in the ARMM or other high-conflict areas of Mindanao returns the same benefit-cost-ratios as infrastructure constructed in areas of moderate conflict. •
UNDP	
44. Sustainable Development Strategy for the Seas of East Asia (PEMSEA), Terminal Evaluation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The simultaneous focus on a “top down” and “bottom up” approach has been conducive to effective stakeholder involvement in PEMSEA supported activities at international, regional, national, provincial and local levels.
45. Samar Island Biodiversity Project (SIBP), Philippines	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Establishment and management of an island-wide PA system, as in the case of SINP, is difficult. • The objective of passing legislation for the formal establishment of the SINP turned out to be an overly ambitious target. • The importance of effectively engaging and mobilizing the local communities, LGUs, and civil society in Project activities cannot be overemphasized. • PMO should be provided with more independence and authority in decision-making • The high-level representation among members of the PSC caused problems
46. Strengthening the Philippines' Institutional Capacity to Adapt to Climate Change (MDG-F 1656)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There are start-up and learning costs associated with first-time joint programme implementation, in terms of a lag time between the approval of the joint programme document and the actual implementation of programme activities, and also a lag time between the occurrence and identification of problems with the actual problem-solving. In a three-year time frame, these costs could be significant and should be factored in the joint programme plan. At the same time, there are learning and ownership benefits from the processes, although these benefits may or may not accrue with the costs. • The quality of the Results Framework in a JP is important because it eventually serves as reference in implementation planning (i.e. in terms of activity and output sequencing), in testing the relevance of the intervention (i.e. in determining how the design corresponds to the needs and problems identified in the programme document), and in formulating the M&E System. Quality assurance of the Results Framework prior to the approval of programme proposals is therefore a crucial activity among donors. Review and possible revision of the Results Framework prior to actual implementation (usually as a result of an inception process) is also a critical activity among programme implementers. • Being a crucial activity, the guidelines for the inception of the JP should be included in the implementation guidelines set by the MDG-F. • Being a crucial activity, the guidelines for the inception of

	<p>the JP should be included in the implementation guidelines set by the MDG-F</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In view of the importance of M&E in the measurement and reporting of development results, the operational plan for the development and implementation of the M&E System for the JP should be clearly spelled out in the programme proposal and in the signed joint programme document. • There could be trade-offs between the efficiency of the JP and its adherence to the other norms in the Delivering As One Concept, and in the other principles and commitments embodied in the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness and the Accra Agenda for Action, specifically on the element of national ownership. • There are limitations in the problem-solving capacities of the PMC and NSC, in consideration of a parallel need to respect the internal decision-making processes of the participating agencies and their institutional mandates. This factor contributes to the lag time in decision-making in a JP. • In the case of MDG-F 1656, the task of joint programme management involved more coordination (among agencies) and facilitation (of agency implementation) than actual staff execution. At the same time, technical programme planning and operations management skills are needed to deliver the committed outputs and outcomes within the time frame. • A Catch-Up Plan may work in meeting the deadline for programme implementation, but it may not leave enough time for the natural gestation and measurement of the development results. • The combined commitment rate system is a good practice in a JP because it encourages the participating agencies to work at a common pace of implementation. It also serves as a tool for joint accountability
<p>47. GPH-UNDP Conflict Prevention and Peace-Building Programme (CPPB)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The conduct of trainings on conflict sensitivity and peace management in CPPB areas improved awareness and promoted people empowerment. These also motivated communities and different sectors of society to participate in peace-building activities. • Acceptability/ Credibility of the RPs helped change behaviors and perspectives that translated into actions like the FCs in San Jose, Tarlac, Tubo, Abra and Leon, Iloilo who organized/ established their own livelihood programs registered with and assisted by government agencies and some of them are now active barangay kagawads. These are important CPPB contributions towards institutionalizing local structures and venues for conflict prevention and peace-building. • Educating LGUs in mentoring them towards implementation of conflict-sensitive projects paved the way to making peace and conflict issues as a key agenda in local governance • The implementation of CPPB projects that focused on

	<p>resource management issues also contributed to resolving differences and/ or root causes of conflict.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Providing livelihood projects that improved the quality of life of the partner communities has been highly appreciated. They felt that the government was finally addressing their needs and concerns. To some, the acquired knowledge and training inspired them to encourage others to participate in OPAPP projects, to make a difference in their community. • Maximizing the role of schools (the pilot School of Peace in Sorsogon), improved conflict management even amongst schoolchildren, and their parents • Engaging the youths and the IPs widened the constituency of the peace network
<p>48. Action for Conflict Transformation (ACT) for Peace Programme</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Peace and Development Community (PDC) concept and approach remained the most vital contribution of the Programme to peacebuilding and conflict transformation. The abilities to negotiate and manage their own peaceful environments, mobilize resources to support their peace and development plans, and share their peacebuilding skills with neighboring communities are vital capacities that will enable communities to transition from unstable to more stable conditions. • The transformation of former combatants needs to be systematically pursued. PDCs and its effects on strengthening social cohesion can systematize the transformation of conflict actors, particularly in the context of the implementation of peace agreements. • The sustainability of the transformation of conflict-affected communities towards peace and development hinges on a truly enabling environment which is primarily characterized by support and commitment of local government units and government agencies primarily, and of the donor community to a certain extent. • Genuine transformation takes time and rigor and requires sustained commitment from all stakeholders. • LGUs are the natural frontline institutions that would take over providing some aspects of the support that the ACT for Peace used to provide to the conflict-affected communities. • The complex and precarious conflict situation in Mindanao necessitates multi-dimensional programmatic interventions to bring about the desired changes.
<p>49. Philippines Efficient Lighting Market Transformation Project (PELMATP)</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • EEL technology is evolving very fast. In this context it is not possible to expect the achievements of a project like PELMATP will permit the country to be in the front of the market for a long time. In this sense it is fundamental for interventions like this one to create financial mechanism to allow independent development of standards by the country government as well as testing equipment procurement in order to break the development aid dependence.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The responsible need to be constantly in contact with the market to be sure the project is always promoting the cutting edge technologies.
--	--